

CRITICAL NOTES

to

LISZT: HUNGARIAN RHAPSODIES

Volume I (Numbers I–IX)

compiled by

Dr. Zoltán Gárdonyi

Sources

- I. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "A son ami E. Szerdahely".¹⁾
Leipzig, 1851. B. Senff. Plate number 23.
- II. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "Au Comte Ladislas Teleky".²⁾
"A": Leipzig, 1851. B. Senff. Plate number 26.
"B": Milan, between 1860 and 1868. G. Ricordi. Plate number 42433.
- III. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "Au Comte Leo Festetics".³⁾
"A": Vienna, 1853. C. Haslinger. Plate number 11555.
"B": Vienna, C. Haslinger, and Berlin, M. Schlesinger (no date).
New printing with the old plate number.
- IV. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "Au Comte Casimir Esterházy".⁴⁾
"A": Vienna, 1853. C. Haslinger. Plate number 11556.
"B": As III. above.
- V. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE
HÉROÏDE-ÉLÉGIAQUE. "À Madame la Comtesse Sidonie Reviczky".⁵⁾
"A": Vienna, 1853. C. Haslinger. Plate number 11557.
"B": As III. above
- VI. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "À S. E. le Comte Antoine d'Appony".⁶⁾
"A": Vienna, 1853. C. Haslinger. Plate number 11558.
"B": As III. above.
- VII. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "Au Baron Fery Orczy".⁷⁾
"A": Vienna, 1853. C. Haslinger. Plate number 11559.
"B": As III. above; not published before 1876.
- VIII. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "À Monsieur A. d'August".⁸⁾
"A": Mainz, 1853. B. Schott's Söhne. Plate number 12486.
"B": Newly engraved edition of "A" with the same plate number; published 1904.
- IX. RHAPSODIE HONGROISE. "À H. W. Ernst".⁹⁾
PESTHER CARNEVAL – LE CARNAVAL DE PESTH
"A": Mainz, 1853. B. Schott's Söhne. Plate number 12487.
"B": Newly engraved edition of the same with identical plate number.

1) More correctly: E. Szerdahély (?), a member of Liszt's Weimar circle in 1851 and presumably also his pupil.

2) Count László Teleki (1811–1861), Hungarian politician, a member of Kossuth's party and a writer. In 1852 he was sentenced to death "in effigie" by the Austrian government while in exile. He later committed suicide.

3) Count Leó Festetics (1800–1884), Hungarian musical amateur and composer. Liszt stayed with him in Pest in December 1839; he led the deputation that presented Liszt with a sword of honour. Liszt arranged his "Spanish Serenade" in 1846 despite his low opinion of his other compositions.

4) Count Kázmér Esterházy, a Hungarian friend of Liszt's who got to know him in Vienna in December 1839.

5) Countess Sidonie Schumlanska. Her husband is presumed to be Ádám Reviczky (1786–1862), through whom Liszt, then in Vienna, in 1838 presented his donation to the flood victims of Pest.

6) Count Antal Apponyi, one of the Hungarian magnates who founded a scholarship for Liszt's foreign studies when he was still a boy. Between 1826 and 1848 he worked as a diplomat in Paris; Liszt took part in his musical evenings in 1829.

7) Baron Ferenc Orczy, Hungarian magnate, presumably the father of the composer Baron Bódog (Felix) Orczy (1831–1892). Liszt was in touch with the younger Baron Orczy between 1870 and 1886.

8) Baron Antal Augustz, chief municipal notary of the Comitatus of Tolna, later deputy palatine (*Vizegespan*) of the same area. After Liszt had received the sword of honour in Pest in 1840 Augustz acted as interpreter for Liszt's answering speech, which was given in French.

9) Heinrich Wilhelm Ernst (1814–1865), German violin virtuoso. He was a member of Liszt's and Chopin's Paris circle in the 1830s.

Rhapsody No. I

Bar 3: The sharp in front of the first *b* natural in the fioritura is in accord both with our source and also most of the later printed editions. P. Raabe's and J. Milstein's publications consider this to be a printer's error and notate the 9th note of the fioritura as a *b* sharp; both quote as their authority the first draft in the Liszt Archive, Weimar (*Ms. J 7*), and also the parallel passage in bar 10. Liszt however carried out a thorough revision of the original draft before the Rhapsody was first published. Another copy of the work in the Széchényi National Library, Budapest (*Ms. Mus. 113,1*) gives evidence of a later stage in which the work is approaching its final state; in it the 5th note of the fioritura is a *b* sharp. Even the analogy of the parallel passage is not all-powerful: the 3rd bar is still in the home key (*C* sharp minor), whereas the 10th bar marks the preparation for the modulation to *E* minor.

Bar 19: In our source there is a natural in front of the lowest note of the last chord in the left hand. We have omitted it on the analogy of the following right hand imitation.

Bars 42, 43, 46 and 47: Our sources give the second pair of thirds in the right hand as a double-dotted crotchet. We have corrected this value.

Bar 76: Our source contains a bar-line after the demisemiquavers in smaller type; it was omitted since the metre of this passage is still 4/4.

Bars 87 and 88: The initial notes in the left hand have been printed as minims rather than crotchets in the interest of uniformity throughout the passage.

Bars 90–91: We have inserted a slur in the right hand by analogy with bars 102–103.

Bar 99: The slur in the right hand is in our source erroneously inserted between the *e* flats rather than between the *a* flats.

Bar 140: The indications *poco a poco cresc.* between the top two staves and *poco a poco più marcato* between the bottom two staves are taken from our source. The latter points to the difference in thematic material.

Bar 157: According to our source the right hand chord has the value of 1/4 whereas in bar 171 it has the value of 1/8. We have chosen the latter value in both places.

Bars 157–158: According to our source the four quavers that have *tr* signs are also given staccato dots; neither here nor in bars 171–172 do they have any justification.

Bar 217: In our source the middle note of the third chord in the right hand is an *e* sharp, although on the basis of the analogy with bar 218 *d* sharp is correct.

Bar 234: Our source does not contain the octave sign needed above the first chord in the right hand.

Bar 238: In our source the lower note on the last quaver in the right hand can also be read as *g* sharp.

Bar 278: We have omitted the right hand *Ossia*, which covers less than seven octaves. The rhythm in the left hand in our source is a dotted quaver followed by a semiquaver. We have corrected this by analogy with bars 276, 284 and 286.

Bar 307: We have taken the dynamic marking of the source not as a *decrescendo* but rather as an accent covering the first two semiquavers.

Bars 317–331: The staccato dots in the bars that end the phrase have been supplied by analogy with bars 191 ff. and 236 ff.

Bar 336: The harmonic contradiction between the *b* sharp in the right hand and the *B* natural in the left is authentic.

Bar 365: In our source the final right hand semiquavers read *g* sharp – *b* natural – *e* followed by *e*. Our correction is justified by the analogy of bars 367 and 369.

Rhapsody No. II

Bar 8: The source of the interpolations written for Lina Schmalhausen is the L–P, the source of the cadenzas written for T. Raab is the autograph preserved in the music collection of the Széchényi National Library, Budapest (shelf mark *Ms. mus. 274*).—See the p. XVII, XVIII.

Bars 35–42: The rests in the left hand appear as 3/16ths by analogy with bars 43–50; as the time-value of the three notes (printed in smaller type) is strictly only 1/16th we have written demisemiquaver triplets in bars 35–50 rather than semiquaver triplets.

Bar 50: The group of 11 notes following the dotted crotchet in the right hand forms an integral part of the rhythm; its time-value amounts in all to 1/8th, for which reason we have written 11 hemidemisemiquavers rather than demisemiquavers.

Bar 54: The slur in the right hand goes to the quaver *g* sharp² in both our sources although it is indubitably meant to go to the semiquaver *d* sharp².

Bars 62–65: The middle notes of the accompanying chords are to be played by the right hand according to source "B".

Bar 89: The first note in the bass is erroneously a *G* sharp in "B".

Bars 118 ff.: We have preserved the indication "Friska" found in our sources both here and in Rhapsody No. XIX. The indication "Friss"—preferable on linguistic grounds to "friska", which is incorrect Hungarian—is found in Rhapsody No. XVIII.

Bars 158–177: There are no pedal marks in "A". We have brought the pedal mark at bar 177 forward by one bar because of the harmony.

Bars 190 and 191: The middle note of the last chord in the right hand is in "B" erroneously *a* sharp.

Bars 275 and 279: The first crotchet of the bar is not dotted in any of the sources.

Bars 344–369: There are no pedal marks in "A".

Bars 362 and 366: The first crotchet of the bar is not dotted in any of the sources.

Bars 393–445: There are no pedal marks in "A".

Rhapsody No. III

Bars 1 and 17: Metronome markings according to L–P.

Bar 1: The slurs in the left hand have been altered to accord with those in bar 47.

Bar 4: The slurs in the left hand have been altered to accord with those in bar 42.

Bar 9: The slurs in the right hand have been altered to accord with those in bar 47.

Bar 11: We have not altered the slurs by analogy with the otherwise similar bars 3, 41 and 49 as the first half of the bar here has a sharper rhythm.

Bar 12: We have not altered the articulation in the right hand by analogy with the otherwise similar bar 50 as the rhythm is not identical in the two passages.

Bar 13: The slurs in the right hand have been altered to accord with bar 51. The minim chord in the left hand has been provided with a tenuto sign on the basis of the L-P.

Bar 14: We have moved the pedal change from the 4th crotchet to the 2nd (cf. bar 6).

Bar 15: The slurs in the right hand have been altered to accord with those in bars 7, 45 and 53.

Bars 29 and 30: We have omitted from the beginning of the bar the *pp* mark which the sources unnecessarily print both times.

Bar 39: The slurs in the left hand have been altered to accord with those in bar 47.

Bar 52: See the note to bar 14.

Bar 59: The slur in the right hand has been altered to accord with that in the analogous bar 55.

Rhapsody No. IV

Bar 14: Our source "A" erroneously presents the value of 4/32nds after the semiquaver rest in the second half of the third crotchet, left hand.

Bar 15: The slur in the left hand erroneously includes the lowest part in source "A".

Bar 21: The second crotchet, right hand, is divided into 16 notes; for this reason we have departed from our sources in printing hemidemisemiquavers rather than demisemiquavers. We have followed the same procedure with the 8 notes that make up the first half of the 4th crotchet.

Bar 22: The notes that make up the first two crotchets in the right hand are here printed as hemidemisemiquavers rather than as the demisemiquavers found in our sources. We have followed the same procedure with the note-values that make up the fourth crotchet. We have begun the slur in the left hand at the first crotchet by analogy with bar 21.

Bar 23: The last crotchet value of the 4/4 bar begins with the *rinforzando molto* and ends with the last hemidemisemiquaver in the right hand. In consequence the semiquaver quintuplet plus the quaver triplet present an excess value of 2 crotchets. The quaver rest after the last chord in the left hand has been placed 6 hemidemisemiquavers later and the fermata has been brought forward by 6 hemidemisemiquavers. Thus the quaver rest with its fermata balances the duration of the excess value of the right hand part.

Bar 35: The slur in the right hand has been altered by analogy with bars 25, 27 and 33.

Bars 41, 43, 50 and 52: We have followed source "B" in assessing the right hand time-values.

Bar 52: The last slur in the right hand has been altered by analogy with bar 43.

Bar 112: We have marked the last quaver in the left hand *staccato*, departing from the *staccatissimo* of our sources, by analogy with bars 80 and 88.

Rhapsody No. V

Bar 1: Metronome marking from L-P.

Bar 8: We have supplied the slurs to the melodic cadence by analogy with bar 34.

Bar 12: According to our sources the time-values of the last 4 notes in the right hand are twice as large. The L-P disposes of the problem of excess in note-values by printing the 8 notes beginning with the second crotchet as demisemiquavers. We consider this solution to be incorrect and for that reason have adopted the rhythm of the analogous bar 38.

Bars 13-14: Source "A" extends the *cresc.* signs beyond the climax of the phrase, for which reason we have preferred to follow source "B".

Bar 20: Milstein inserts a natural before the middle note of the last triplet in the right hand. Although this sign seems to be harmonically justified by the previous *c* in the left hand, the *c* sharp is justified melodically by virtue of being the lower changing note of the *d*.

Bar 24: The last two notes in the right hand are printed in our source "A" as dotted crotchets and without triplet signs. As this rhythm exceeds the value of the bar by one crotchet we have preferred to follow the undotted triplet rhythm of source "B".

Bar 27: The reprise of the opening theme does not have the *tre corde* indication in source "A" though it appears in source "B". In our opinion the cancellation of the *una corda* indication should come before the *rinforz.* in bar 25.

Bar 35: The rhythm of the right hand is contradictory in source "A": the second half of the last crotchet is dotted and endowed with a triplet sign. We have followed our source "B" here, where the rhythm in the right hand accords with that of bars 9, 51 and similar passages, and the rhythm of the left hand is identical with that of bars 36, 38 and 39.

Bar 41: The fermata in the right hand is placed above the empty stave in our sources. We have supplied beneath it the missing quaver rest required to complete the 4/4 bar. The sum of the time-values in the left hand is 25/16ths according to our sources. We are in agreement with Milstein's edition about the inclusion of the semiquaver *a* before the grace-note. The sum of the time-values is admittedly one semiquaver too great, but this is a consequence of the *ritenuito*.

Bar 46: The ambiguous indication *ritenuto a piacere il tempo* from our sources has been made clear by the addition of a comma.

Bar 50: The last note in the right hand is according to "A" a demisemiquaver, according to "B" a semiquaver. Although the L-P gives the rhythm of source "A", we follow the rhythm given in source "B" since the beginning of the major key theme in this way accords with the rhythm of bar 52.

Bar 62: The ambiguous indication *dolce sempre appassionato* from our sources has been made clear by the addition of a comma.

Bar 80: The dynamic signs in the left hand are taken over from the L-P.

Bar 82: The first chord in the right hand has the value of one demisemiquaver according to source "A"; we have preferred to follow the rhythm of "B".

Rhapsody No. VI

Bar 23: The arpeggio sign at the third chord in the left hand has been supplied by analogy with bar 31.

Bar 28: The slur in the left hand has been supplied by analogy with bars 12 and 20.

Bar 34: The lower note of the last semiquaver in the left hand is an *a* flat according to source "A", whereas source "B" has an *e* flat. We have adopted the latter by analogy with bar 26.

Bar 40: The left hand fermata designating a semibreve rest has been omitted.

Bar 52: The *forte* marking in this syncopated bar has been supplied by analogy with bars 44, 48 and 56.

Bar 62: The lowest note of the first crotchet in the left hand is a *d* sharp according to our sources, but we have preferred a *b* sharp by analogy with bar 70. This solution is also justified by the earlier version of the work.

Bar 77: According to source "A" there is a quaver rest before the last two quavers in the right hand, but no fermata or triplet sign. We have supplied the two last-mentioned signs from source "B".

Bar 84: We have supplied the fermata in the left hand from source "B".

Bar 85: Source "A" divides the last crotchet in the right hand into $7/32\text{nds} + 5/32\text{nds} + 3/16\text{ths}$, source "B" divides it into $7/32\text{nds} + 5/64\text{ths} + 3/16\text{ths}$; neither is correct. Our sources omit the natural which is needed before the *g* in the fioritura of the 3rd crotchet, right hand.

Bar 88: The second dot needed after the last quaver rest sign in the left hand is missing from our source "A".

Bar 91: Both our sources give the last group of three notes in the right hand in double note-values; furthermore source "B" lacks the dot before the first crotchet in the right hand.

Bar 116: The third quaver in the left hand is according to both our sources an *f* sharp. In its place we have preferred an *a*, which is found in the autograph and is also justified by the analogy of bar 147.

Rhapsody No. VII

Bar 6: In both our sources the last note of the arpeggio in the right hand is joined with a slur to the highest note of the minim chord. We have omitted this slur by analogy with bar 24.

Bar 8: The natural before the *b* in the second chord is missing from both our sources.

Bar 28: The natural before the *g* in both hands is missing from both sources.

Bar 32: Our sources give the dynamic sign *piano* whereas we recommend *pianissimo* on the analogy of the reprise

(bars 185 ff); in this way the *piano* that follows the *cresc.* sign in bars 36–37 is made more logical.

Bars 72 and 78: The natural before the *b* of the 1st and 6th semiquavers is found in none of the sources.

Bars 95 and 101: The natural before the last *b* quaver in the left hand is found in none of our sources.

Bars 105–152: We have unified the signs of articulation in the right hand.

Bar 129: We have moved the sign *sempre piano* forward to the beginning of the bar; in this we depart from our sources.

Bar 176: Our sources place the *sempre piano* in the second half of the bar. We have moved it to the beginning of bar 177 so as to avoid an upbeat metre.

Bar 181: The sharp required before the 4th and 7th semiquavers is missing from both our sources.

Bars 219–246: We have unified the quavers of the opening bar of each three-bar group as *staccatissimo*, as this is in keeping with the *fff* of the dynamic marking, whereas the sources contain inconsistent *staccato* signs.

Rhapsody No. VIII

Bar 5: We have supplied the second grace-note in the right hand by analogy with bar 15.

Bar 9: We have clarified the tempo indication after the double bar-line by adding a comma.

Bar 12: Below the second fermata in the left hand there is a semiquaver rest in both the sources. In consequence the remaining 6 small notes form an integral part of the rhythm. For this reason we have written a hemidemisemiquaver sextuplet in place of demisemiquavers.

Bar 16: We have altered the slur in the right hand by analogy with bar 6.

Bars 22 and 23: The slurs in the right hand have been supplied by analogy with bars 6 and 17.

Bar 26: The values of the right hand notes add up to 6 quavers, those of the left hand to 5. We have not corrected this discrepancy however as the *fermate* in both hands point towards a *quasi cadenza* interpretation.

Bar 28: The value of the chord in the right hand which has a fermata is according to "A" one semiquaver, according to "B" one quaver; we have followed source "A". The 12 note long passage in the left hand corresponds to the quaver rest in the right hand. For that reason hemidemisemiquaver triplets should have been written. We have kept to Liszt's original notation, however, since it indicates that the density of this figure is to correspond with that of the accompanying right hand arpeggios. The fermata that we have supplied in the left hand part is intended to signify *quasi cadenza*.

Bar 33: The triplet in the left hand begins simultaneously with the last chord in the right hand according to the graphic layout of our sources; the left hand trill therefore has the value of $5/16\text{ths}$. The whole bar has an excess time value of one semiquaver, to be accounted for by the very slight broadening before the end of the melodic strophe.

The last chord in the right hand has the value of one quaver according to our source "B"; we have preferred to follow source "A".

Bar 37: The values in the right hand add up to 28/64ths without the notes in small type; consequently the cadenza (in small type) has a theoretical value of 4/64ths.

Bar 38: The 30 hemidemisemiquavers that follow the quaver with a fermata in the right hand have the theoretical value of three quavers.

Bars 117 and 126: The highest note in the right hand is according to our source "A" an erroneous *g* sharp³.

Bar 137: The 16 demisemiquavers that make up the second half of the bar have a theoretical value of one crotchet.

Rhapsody No. IX

Bar 1: The *marcatissimo* signs against the double-dotted crotchets have been altered to simple *marcati* on the analogy of bar 20.

Bar 14: The upper note in the left hand is in both our sources a minim. In its place we have supplied a dotted crotchet.

Bar 17: The first three crotchets form a triplet according to source "A", whereas source "B" has no triplet sign. We have decided in favour of a sextuplet decision for the whole bar, as the augmentation of the motif, which contracts melodically as it continues, stands out more clearly in this way.—The value of the two last sixth-chords is according to source "A" 7/16ths + 1/8th, according to "B" 7/16ths + 1/32nd. The value of the last note had in any case to be corrected.

Bar 41: The rhythm in the right hand departs in the last part of the bar according to source "A" from that of the otherwise analogous bars 37, 39 and 43: 1/8th + 3/32nds—rest 1/32nd.—We have followed the consistent rhythmic division of source "B".

Bar 48: The value of the rest and note following the second chord in the left hand is according to "A" 3/32nds + 1/16th, whereas according to "B" it is 3/32nds + 1/32nd. Our correction is justified by the analogous material at bar 44.

Bar 51: The fermata above the demisemiquaver rest in the right hand points to a very slight agogic extension. For that reason we have not placed a fermata in the left hand part.

Bar 52: The rhythm of the last part of the bar is in both our sources a rest of 7/32nds and a demisemiquaver. We have altered this on the analogy of bar 56.

Bar 58: For a comment on the rhythm in the right hand at the last crotchet of the bar, see the note to bar 48.

Bar 70: We do not reproduce the 15 note *Ossia* of our sources since it applies only to keyboards with fewer than seven octaves.

Bar 102: The rhythm at quavers 2–4 in the right hand is in both sources demisemiquaver + semiquaver + demisemiquaver rest. The same musical material returns in Lombard rhythm in bars 166–167. As the earlier version of the work

gives the lower notes merely as grace-notes we have here, too, preferred the Lombard rhythm.

Bar 123: The highest note of the last chord in the left hand is according to both our sources a *d*¹. Our correction is based on the analogy of bars 111, 113, 119 and 121.

Bars 137 and 141: There is no natural in front of the last note in the right hand in our source "A".

Bars 166–167: The signs of articulation in the right hand have been supplied by analogy with bar 102.

Bar 169: The *rall.* of source "A" is more easily justified than the *rit.* of source "B". Our decision is further supported by the earlier version of the work. Both the sources also have a fermata at the chord in the left hand; we have omitted it as superfluous. The semiquaver triplet in faint type in the right hand part belongs to the second half of the crotchet chord.

Bar 170: Both our sources interrupt the wavy arpeggio line by a *smorz.* indication, although the two lines produced in this way belong together, as the analogy of bar 105 shows.

Bar 225: Both our sources have a *marcatissimo* wedge above the last note in the left hand; we have preferred a *tenuto* sign on the analogy of bars 237 and 331.

Bar 239: The signs of articulation have been corrected according to bar 227.

Bar 270: Here and later we have interpreted the ornament as a passing appoggiatura. See footnote to bars 37–43.

Bar 309: Our source "A" places *staccato* dots on the first crotchet, our source "B" places them on the two crotchets. We have used *tenuto* signs on the analogy of bar 303.

Bars 352–355: The left hand progresses in octave chords according to both our sources, as in bars 356–359. P. Raabe gives his reasons on page X of his "Herausgeberbericht" in the *Gesamtausgabe* (Breitkopf and Härtel, II/12) for following not the printed editions but the autograph. We consider Raabe's correction to be entirely justified.

Bars 407, 411, 415, 417, 419 and 421: The initial note of the melody might be considered to require dotting since the melody continues with the last semiquaver of the second crotchet unit.

Bar 410: Neither of our sources contains the *G–g* octave which is part of the melody and belongs to the 3rd crotchet in the left hand. We have supplied it by analogy with bar 418.

Bar 423: The tempo indication in our sources contains an erroneous *fino*.

Bars 428 and 430: Our sources contain a rather broad *marcato* wedge at the 4th quaver in the left hand. It would be wrong to take it as a *decrecendo*.

Bars 436 and 438: Here, too, we have taken the ornament as a passing appoggiatura. See the remark on bar 270 and the footnote to bars 37–43.

Bar 449: The left hand in both our sources plays *D* flat–*d* flat at the third quaver of the bar. The *d* flat–*c* parallel octave formed with the bass of the melody does not re-

quire the alteration of the bass since Liszt consciously and deliberately used such parallel octaves in several of his works which use Hungarian themes, and even emphasized them specially by means of the indication *Ungarischer Bass* or *Zigeuner-Bass*. (See the MS "Zum Andenken" or the corrected proofs of the 9th number of the 3rd volume of *Un-*

garische National-Melodien.) Similar parallel octaves may be found by the dozen in the *Vivace assai* section of the Hungarian Rhapsody No. XIV.

Bars 480–483: We do not include the *Ossia* from our sources since it applies only to keyboards with a range of fewer than seven octaves.

(translated by Peter Branscombe)